

ANALYSIS OF HOLISTIC EVALUATION MODEL IMPLEMENTATION IN THE ISLAMIC EDUCATION CURRICULUM AT ISLAMIC HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS

Rini Dewi Andriani, Masruroh Lubis

Universitas Islam Sumatera Utara, Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Sumatera Medan

Email: rinidewi@fai.uisu.ac.id, akunmasruroh123@gmail.com

How to cite:

Andriani, R. D., Lubis, M. (2025). Analysis of Holistic Evaluation Model Implementation in the Islamic Education Curriculum Islamic Higher Education Institutions. *Fitrah: Journal of Islamic Education*, 6(2), 326-341. <https://doi.org/10.53802/fitrah.v6i2.1349>

KEYWORDS

Holistic Evaluation, Islamic Education Curriculum, Islamic Higher Education

ABSTRACT

This research departs from the problem of the less than optimal application of a comprehensive evaluation model in measuring the success of the Islamic education curriculum in Islamic universities. The existing evaluation still focuses on academic achievement, while the moral, spiritual, and character building aspects of students have not been adequately assessed. This condition causes the goal of holistic Islamic education has not been achieved as a whole. This research was conducted in three universities, namely STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, and STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai, with the aim of analyzing the strengths and weaknesses of the implementation of the CIPP holistic evaluation model in each dimension—Context, Input, Process, and Product. The results showed that synergy between dimensions is the key to successful implementation of this model. When the context and input are strengthened and the learning process runs effectively, the educational outcomes are not only academically superior, but also shape the character and spirituality of students according to Islamic values. The implications of this research emphasize the need to develop an evaluation system that is oriented towards the balance between intellectual achievement and the formation of moral-spiritual values, so that Islamic universities are able to produce graduates with integrity, ethics, and contribute positively to society.

KATA KUNCI:

Holistik Evaluasi, Kurikulum Pendidikan Islam, Pendidikan Tinggi Islam

ABSTRAK

Penelitian ini berangkat dari permasalahan kurang optimalnya penerapan model evaluasi yang komprehensif dalam mengukur keberhasilan kurikulum pendidikan Islam di perguruan tinggi Islam. Evaluasi yang ada masih berfokus pada capaian akademik, sementara aspek moral, spiritual, dan pembentukan karakter mahasiswa belum dinilai secara memadai. Kondisi ini menyebabkan tujuan pendidikan Islam yang holistik belum tercapai secara utuh. Penelitian ini dilakukan di tiga perguruan tinggi, yaitu STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, dan STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai, dengan tujuan menganalisis kekuatan dan kelemahan implementasi model evaluasi holistik CIPP pada setiap dimensinya—Context, Input, Process, dan Product. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa sinergi antar dimensi merupakan kunci keberhasilan implementasi model ini. Ketika konteks dan input diperkuat serta proses pembelajaran berjalan efektif, maka hasil pendidikan tidak hanya unggul secara akademik, tetapi juga membentuk karakter dan spiritualitas mahasiswa sesuai nilai-nilai Islam. Implikasi dari penelitian ini menegaskan perlunya pengembangan sistem evaluasi yang berorientasi pada keseimbangan antara pencapaian intelektual dan pembentukan nilai moral-spiritual, agar perguruan tinggi Islam mampu menghasilkan lulusan yang berintegritas, beretika, dan berkontribusi positif bagi masyarakat.

INTRODUCTION

The curriculum, as the core of the education system, plays a decisive role in achieving educational goals. It is not merely a collection of learning materials, but a basic framework that regulates the relationship between goals, learning methods, evaluation, and expected outcomes (Oktapiani et al., 2021; Rohmani, 2020; Susilowati et al., 2025). Especially in Islamic education in higher education, the curriculum is not only an intellectual tool but also an instrument for shaping the character, morality, and spirituality of students (Lubis et al., 2024). In the era of globalization and modernization, when challenges to values and identity are increasingly complex, the effectiveness of the Islamic education curriculum has become an urgent issue that needs to be examined thoroughly. Although many Islamic education programs include formal religious courses and Islamic teachings, various studies show that there is a gap between ideal religious goals and the realization of Islamic values in students' actions, ranging from moral degradation, apathy towards religious teachings, to a pragmatic approach to religion (Daniel L. Stufflebeam, 2003).

To comprehensively assess the extent to which the Islamic education curriculum achieves its objectives, a holistic evaluation model is needed. One of the most widely recognized models in the literature is the CIPP evaluation model, which consists of four components: Context, Input, Process, and Product. The CIPP model was introduced by Daniel Stufflebeam and

emphasizes that evaluation must consider whether the needs (context) have been correctly identified; whether the resources, materials, methods, and capacity (input) are sufficient and relevant; whether the implementation process (process) is going as planned; and whether the final results or products (product) are on target and provide real benefits (Ali & Rehman, 2018; Karaca & Ozdemir, 2020). This kind of holistic evaluation allows stakeholders to assess not only the end result but also the preliminary aspects and processes, thereby identifying the strengths and weaknesses of curriculum implementation (Abshor et al., 2024; Jannah, 2022).

In the context of Islamic education in Indonesia, several studies have used the CIPP model in various settings: for example, in the 'microteaching' program at IAIN Sorong, which showed that all dimensions of CIPP (context, input, process, product) were considered very effective (Jannah, 2022). Other studies have also used this model to evaluate the Tahfizh program, or to evaluate curricula in secondary education and madrasahs, which consistently show that despite positive aspects, there are often obstacles in the input and process sections, especially related to resources and teaching methods (Abshor et al., 2024). However, very few studies have focused on specific Islamic universities, and on three institutions in one region, with a comparative analysis of the implementation of CIPP in Islamic education curricula.

Three institutions in North Sumatra—namely STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, STAI Al-

Hikamah Tebing Tinggi, and STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai—are the focus of this study because each has a different background, institutional structure, number of students, teaching staff, and resources, enabling a rich analysis of how the holistic evaluation model (CIPP) is implemented in the context of higher Islamic education. At STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, for example, there are efforts to align the curriculum with local and global needs, but questions arise as to whether the resources of lecturers and supporting facilities are sufficient to support teaching and evaluation in accordance with standards. At STAI Al-Hikamah Tebing Tinggi, there are challenges in the learning and evaluation processes of Islamic studies courses that combine theory and practice; while at STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai, there are concerns about curriculum output—whether graduates truly have the religious integrity, professional competence, and social readiness to contribute to society.

The purpose of this study is to analyze in depth the implementation of the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, and Product) Holistic Evaluation Model in the Islamic education curriculum at three Islamic universities, namely STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, and STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai. This research, entitled, aims to explore how the four dimensions of the CIPP model are applied in the context of Islamic higher education through a qualitative approach, with a focus on identifying strengths, weaknesses, obstacles, and opportunities for development. In this study, the Context aspect will be examined by exploring

the views of various related parties regarding the needs of students, the community, Islamic values, and institutional goals that influence the curriculum. The Input aspect will be analyzed through interviews and discussions with lecturers and related parties regarding competencies, learning resources, facilities, and training that support curriculum implementation. The Process aspect will be explored by examining how the curriculum is implemented, including teaching methods, evaluation, and interactions between students and lecturers. Meanwhile, the Product aspect will evaluate the results of curriculum implementation, both in terms of academic achievement, spiritual and moral strengthening, and the contribution of graduates to society. Through this qualitative approach, this study aims to provide a comprehensive picture of the implementation of the CIPP model in Islamic education and provide a strong basis for formulating strategies to improve the quality of education in Islamic higher education.

This research has several unique features or distinctions. First, the research was conducted at Islamic higher education institutions (not schools or madrasas) in three institutions in the North Sumatra region, allowing for contextual comparisons between Islamic higher education institutions in one area. Second, the research focuses not only on output or results, but on all stages of CIPP (context, input, process, product), providing a holistic picture of curriculum implementation. Third, this study will also

consider religious/spiritual aspects and moral character in the curriculum product, not just academic competence, responding to criticism that many evaluations of Islamic education place too much emphasis on academic results and neglect aspects of character and values. Fourth, the study will combine data from documents, interviews, observations, and institutional reports, thereby ensuring high validity of the results.

Theoretically, this study is expected to enrich the literature on the evaluation of Islamic education curricula at the university level by using the CIPP framework as a holistic model. This study will clarify how evaluation theories such as CIPP are applied in the context of higher Islamic education, test the relevance of theory to practice in solid Islamic institutions, and produce modifications or recommendations for theory if gaps between theory and practice are found. Practically, the results of this research can provide concrete input for Islamic higher education institution administrators—deans, department heads, lecturers—in improving curriculum design, strengthening input, refining teaching and evaluation processes in the classroom, and improving graduate outcomes in terms of academics, Islam, and character. Another practical contribution includes policy recommendations for Islamic higher education institutions at the regional and national levels regarding curriculum evaluation standards, lecturer training, resource allocation, and integrated evaluation mechanisms that consider all dimensions of CIPP.

Thus, the significance of this study goes beyond merely describing the situation; it provides an in-depth analysis of the implementation of the CIPP holistic evaluation model in the Islamic education curriculum at STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, and STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai. This study is expected to show the extent to which the curriculum in these institutions is in line with the principles of holistic evaluation, identify obstacles that hinder ideal implementation, and formulate improvement strategies based on empirical data. Thus, this study is expected to contribute both theoretically to the development of evaluation models in Islamic education and practically to the improvement of the quality of Islamic higher education in Indonesia.

THEORY DESCRIPTION

Evaluation is an integral part of the education system that serves to ensure the achievement of learning objectives comprehensively, covering the academic, moral, social, and spiritual aspects of students. In the context of Islamic education, evaluation is not only directed at measuring cognitive learning outcomes, but also assesses the extent to which the learning process is able to shape the character, personality, and Islamic values of students (Irsad, 2016). Evaluation in Islamic education must be comprehensive, considering the balance between intellectual, emotional, and spiritual aspects in order to describe the

wholeness of human beings in accordance with the objectives of Islamic education, which is oriented towards the formation of perfect human beings.

The CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model developed by Daniel L. Stufflebeam is one of the most comprehensive evaluation frameworks for assessing the effectiveness of educational programs (D L Stufflebeam & Shinkfield, 2007). This model consists of four components: (1) Context, assessing the suitability of program objectives with the needs of students, the community, and the vision of the institution; (2) Input, assessing the adequacy of human resources, facilities, funds, and learning strategies; (3) Process, examining how the curriculum is implemented, including learning methods, lecturer and student involvement, and evaluation systems; (4) Product, evaluating the final results of the program, both in terms of academics, character, and social impact.

The CIPP model is often used in Islamic education because it is able to describe the relationship between Islamic values and educational effectiveness. Solehah (2022), found that the context and product dimensions of the CIPP model are the main indicators of the success of the Islamic education curriculum, but the input and process aspects often determine the effectiveness of implementation. Meanwhile, Syafaruddin, Saputra, and Sutrisno (2022), through research in madrasahs in North Sumatra, showed that the CIPP model can

identify the relationship between curriculum management and religious learning outcomes.

Julianitakasih Ilyasa and Madjid (2021) also applied this model in evaluating the Al-Qur'an therapy program in special schools and found that product success was greatly influenced by the appropriateness of the context and the quality of the inputs and processes carried out. These three studies confirm that the CIPP model allows for a more in-depth analysis of how Islamic education policies and practices operate in the field. From an Islamic education perspective, the CIPP model is in line with the views of thinkers such as Al-Ghazali (2011) and Al-Attas (1997), who emphasize the importance of unity between knowledge, practice, and manners. CIPP-based evaluation of Islamic curricula allows for analysis not only of academic achievement but also of the formation of students' spiritual and moral values.

Thus, the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) theory becomes a highly relevant conceptual basis for analyzing the implementation of the Islamic education curriculum at STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, and STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai. This theory provides a comprehensive evaluation framework for assessing various aspects that influence the effectiveness of the curriculum, ranging from the context, available resources (input), the learning process applied, to the final results (product). Through the CIPP model, this study aims to explore the relationship between these

four dimensions and identify factors that support or hinder the achievement of holistic Islamic education goals, without prejudging the actual research results.

METHOD

This research is *field research* using qualitative methods and a case study approach. This approach was chosen because the research aims to gain an in-depth understanding of how the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model is implemented in Islamic education curricula in Islamic higher education institutions. The qualitative approach allows researchers to explore the meaning, experiences, and dynamics of curriculum implementation that cannot be measured quantitatively but are understood through direct interaction with informants and the institutional context (Creswell, 2007).

The research was conducted at three Islamic universities in North Sumatra, namely STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, and STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai. The selection of these three locations was based on the consideration that all three have different institutional characteristics, in terms of vision and mission, curriculum, and human resources, but are equally oriented towards strengthening Islamic values at the university level. These contextual differences allow the researcher to conduct a comparative analysis and identify common patterns and specific characteristics in

the implementation of the CIPP evaluation model at each institution.

The research data sources consisted of primary and secondary data. Primary data was obtained directly from informants who were considered to have a deep understanding of the implementation of the curriculum and evaluation system at each university. The main informants included the head of the Islamic Education study program, lecturers teaching Islamic subjects, educational staff, and active students, with a total of 18 people, six from each institution. Meanwhile, secondary data was obtained from curriculum documents, academic guidelines, academic activity reports, internal evaluation results, and other relevant supporting documents.

Data collection techniques were carried out through three main methods, namely observation, in-depth interviews, and documentation studies. Observations were conducted directly on campus to observe curriculum implementation, the learning process, and lecturer-student interactions. Interviews were conducted in a semi-structured manner so that researchers could gather information flexibly, while documentation studies were used to reinforce the data from observations and interviews with written evidence available at each institution.

Data analysis was conducted using a *multisite* analysis model, which aimed to find similarities and differences in the implementation of the CIPP evaluation model at

the three research sites (Hasiara, 2018). Each site was analyzed individually, then compared to obtain more comprehensive patterns and meanings. To ensure data validity, the researcher applied source and method triangulation techniques, extended the time spent in the field, conducted *member checks* with informants, and systematically documented the entire research process to ensure that the results were valid, reliable, and scientifically accountable (Bogdan, Robert, 2011).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Implementation of the Holistic Evaluation Model in the Islamic Education Curriculum

This study found that the implementation of the CIPP evaluation model in the three Islamic universities— STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, and STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai —showed a combination of strengths and weaknesses specific to each institution. However, there was a general pattern that could be analyzed conceptually. In the Context dimension of the , the three institutions generally have a vision and mission that uphold the strengthening of Islamic values and moral character in the curriculum. At STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, the institutional vision explicitly includes religious and character aspects, but the formulation of student and community needs as the basis for the curriculum is not always adequate. At STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, there is an emphasis on Islamic cultural locality as part of the curriculum

context, but it has not been integrated with formal evaluation; while at STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai, the institution is relatively more assertive in formulating moral objectives and social contributions, although it has not detailed the specific needs of individual students. This lack of context identification is in line with Stufflebeam and Shinkfield's view in that weaknesses in context analysis will result in inaccurate educational policy directions and learning objectives.

In terms of input, the three campuses showed significant variations. At STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, the teaching staff were competent and had undergone several pedagogical training courses, but learning facilities and character evaluation modules were still limited. STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi faced greater obstacles in terms of technological facilities, learning media, and limited funds for Islamic-based research. Meanwhile, STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai has relatively stronger institutional support— , religious facilities, and lecturer training are available—but has not yet developed a systematic moral-spiritual evaluation tool. These input barriers are in line with CIPP theory, which asserts that weak inputs will hinder the successful implementation and achievement of educational outcomes (Aziz et al., 2018; Vishnupriyan, 2017).

In the Process dimension, the three institutions still tend to be oriented towards lecture methods and cognitive evaluation. At STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, adab interactions in

the classroom are beginning to grow, but character evaluation is still sporadic and informal. STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi carries out a number of spiritual and da'wah activities, but their implementation has not yet become a formal part of the assessment system. At STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai, the integration of religious activities such as regular recitation and spiritual reflection has been carried out consistently, but the documentation and evaluation system are still not standardized. This condition reinforces the results of research by Abshor et al., (2024), which found that the *process* aspect is often a critical point in the application of the CIPP model because it is directly related to the translation of vision into concrete actions in the learning process.

In the Product dimension, all three institutions have achieved fairly good academic results, but the moral and spiritual achievements of students still vary. At STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, students have a good understanding of Islam but do not yet show consistency in moral practice. At STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, graduates are able to master the theories of da'wah and fiqh, but are still weak in applying ethical values. Meanwhile, STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai shows a more prominent spiritual improvement among students due to regular religious guidance, although not all students feel the same impact. This pattern is in line with the results of research on the Tahfidz program (Aziz et al., 2018) which shows that even though the context and input are strong, product

achievement can remain low if the process aspect is not optimally managed.

Analytically, the findings from the three research locations reinforce the basic principle of the CIPP model that each dimension is functionally interrelated. A strong context without adequate input support will weaken the process, and the end result will not be optimal. Holistic evaluation theory emphasizes that each dimension must be optimized synergistically so that the evaluation truly reflects the success of education comprehensively (Frye & Hemmer, 2012). Therefore, it is necessary to strengthen the Islamic values evaluation module, train lecturers in affective evaluation, and implement a reflective documentation system so that the CIPP evaluation model can be fully implemented at all stages.

The implementation of CIPP in these three universities proves its relevance as a curriculum analysis tool that not only assesses the final results but also identifies the root causes in the context, resources, and implementation. With systematic strengthening in each dimension, Islamic education at the university level can be more effective in producing academics with character and noble morals.

Strengths and Weaknesses of the Holistic Evaluation Model in the Islamic Education Curriculum

The implementation of the CIPP Holistic Evaluation Model in the Islamic education curriculum at three universities—STAI Al-

Hikmah Medan, STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, and STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai—reveals diverse strengths and weaknesses, reflecting the character and policies of each institution. In terms of context, all three institutions have a strong vision and mission in instilling Islamic values and character building. At STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, the vision and mission emphasize the integration of knowledge and faith, but the analysis of student and community needs has not been fully accommodated. STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi strengthens the elements of Islamic cultural locality in the curriculum, but this is not followed by formal, measurable evaluation. Meanwhile, at STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai, the formulation of moral and social objectives is more concrete, although it does not yet address the individual needs of students. This condition shows that the context analysis is not yet optimal, as emphasized by Stufflebeam and Shinkfield (2007) that context evaluation determines the relevance of educational objectives to the real needs of society.

In terms of input, STAI Al-Hikmah Medan has competent and active lecturers, but is still constrained by laboratory facilities and digital resources. STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi faces constraints in financial support, digital infrastructure, and the availability of learning media. Meanwhile, STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai is relatively superior in institutional support and spiritual activities, but has not yet developed structured moral evaluation modules. Shimaneni & Kiley (2025) emphasize that an imbalance between human resources and infrastructure will hinder the

effective implementation of a values-based curriculum.

In the Process dimension, learning practices at all three campuses are still oriented towards a cognitive approach through lectures and written exams. At STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, the practice of teaching manners in class has begun, but it has not yet become a formal evaluation instrument. At STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, spiritual activities are incidental and not yet integrated into the student evaluation system. Meanwhile, STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai integrates religious studies and reflection on a regular basis, but does not yet have a systematic mechanism for documenting values. Karakus (2021) emphasizes that the success of the Process dimension is highly dependent on reflection mechanisms, lecturer involvement, and consistency in implementing values in learning practices.

In the Product dimension, the academic achievements of students at the three universities are relatively good, but moral and spiritual achievements still vary. Graduates of STAI Al-Hikmah Medan excel in theoretical understanding of Islam, but have not fully demonstrated the internalization of moral values. Graduates of STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi have mastered the theories of da'wah and fiqh, but the application of ethical values is not yet stable. Meanwhile, at STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai, spiritual guidance has resulted in a more consistent increase in religiosity. This phenomenon reinforces the findings of Abshor et al. (2024) that the success of the product is highly dependent on the sustainability of value practices

in the learning process, not just the quality of input and context.

Analytically, the patterns in the three locations show a strong correlation between the CIPP dimensions. Weaknesses in input and process are the main factors that reduce the quality of moral-spiritual output. Frye and Hemmer (2012) in Medical Teacher emphasize the importance of holistic evaluation that does not stop at academic results but also assesses changes in students' attitudes and behavior through portfolio methods, observation, and reflection. Therefore, the CIPP holistic evaluation model has proven to be relevant for strengthening the implementation of the Islamic education curriculum as a whole, provided that each dimension is optimized in a balanced manner (Ionescu et al., 2022; Kamara et al., 2024).

Strategies for Improving the Quality of Islamic Education Using the Holistic Evaluation Model in the Islamic Education Curriculum

This study reveals that each institution has demonstrated strengths that can be used as a starting point in formulating quality improvement strategies. However, there are also systemic weaknesses that need to be addressed in order to optimize the CIPP evaluation model comprehensively. At STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, the greatest strength lies in the institutional vision that clearly promotes the integration of Islamic values with character development. This provides strong legitimacy for value-based

curriculum policies. On the downside, the analysis of student and community needs as a contextual basis is still unstructured; supporting facilities and character evaluation modules are inadequate; and the character evaluation process is still sporadic. Quality improvement strategies in Medan should focus on strengthening the needs analysis instruments (e.g., surveys of the values of students and the local community) and enriching the documented character evaluation modules.

STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi shows strength in the context of Islamic cultural locality, which has been recognized as an element of institutional differentiation, so quality strategies must utilize local cultural capital as a means of instilling values. However, there are striking weaknesses in terms of input and process: technological facilities and learning media for values are inadequate, funds for value development are limited, and the evaluation of religious processes has not become a formal mechanism. Therefore, a suitable strategy is to strengthen investment in value teaching infrastructure (digital media, interactive modules, spiritual reflection rooms) and to design a mandatory and documented value process evaluation system. In addition, ongoing training for lecturers on affective value evaluation must be a priority.

STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai has institutional strength in routine religious guidance and institutional support for spiritual activities. This can be used as a basis for a

quality assurance strategy: making value practices (routine recitation, communal worship, reflection) a formal part of the curriculum and evaluation. Weaknesses arise from the lack of a systematic moral-spiritual evaluation module and a weak documentation system for non-academic results. The strategy in Binjai needs to formalize the integration of religious activities into the curriculum evaluation system, create standard character assessment instruments, and strengthen the documentation and reporting system for non-cognitive values.

Comparatively, a pattern emerges from the three institutions that strategies for improving the quality of Islamic education must be holistic and synergistic between the CIPP dimensions. A strong context (value vision, Islamic identity) must be combined with adequate input (value evaluation modules, lecturer training, learning media). Quality inputs are the foundation for a consistent process, with structured, reflective, and documented character/spiritual evaluation. Only if the value process is consistent can the output of character and moral achieve the expected results. This is in line with the CIPP model principle, which emphasizes the functional interrelationship between the dimensions of

Holistic evaluation theory also reminds us that quality strategies should not only pursue academic *products*, but must also elevate affective and spiritual *products* as an integral part of educational quality (Finney, 2020). International studies in professional education and curriculum

have shown that the use of the CIPP model enables decision-makers to formulate improvement policies based on an analysis of context, input, process, and product (Zhang, 2011). For example, the study Effectiveness Assessment by Using the CIPP Model (Mokhtarzadegan, 2015) concluded that weaknesses in the process and input dimensions are often the main obstacles to achieving the expected results.

In the context of Islamic institutions, quality models (such as total quality management) are associated with quality leadership, strategic planning, and staff empowerment—strategies that are relevant for Islamic institutions to maintain Islamic values while improving academic quality (Mirzazadeh & al., 2016; Rooholamini & al., 2017). In research related to quality strategies for Islamic universities, the *balanced scorecard* approach has also been proposed as an integrative mechanism between vision, finance, internal processes, and growth (Finney, 2020; Poblete, 2014; Yoshany & Al., 2025). Furthermore, the implementation of the Internal Quality Assurance System (SPMI) in Islamic higher education institutions has proven to play an important role in promoting institutional competitiveness by strengthening internal capacity, academic innovation, and external cooperation (Lippe & Carter, 2018; Zhang & al., 2011).

Based on a combination of these findings and theories, comprehensive quality improvement strategies include: (1)

strengthening context analysis and identifying the needs of students and the community; (2) developing and updating standard moral-spiritual evaluation modules; (3) conducting continuous training for lecturers and educators in affective and spiritual evaluation; (4) making religious and character activities a formal part of the learning and evaluation process; (5) developing a transparent documentation and reporting system for non-cognitive values; (6) applying quality management approaches such as *balanced scorecards* or SPMI so that quality strategies are structured and monitored. With mutually supportive strategies across the CIPP dimensions, the Islamic academic triad can function more effectively, and Islamic institutions can produce graduates who are not only intellectually superior but also morally and spiritually mature.

Research Novelty and Contribution to Theory

This research makes a significant contribution to the development of curriculum evaluation models in Islamic education, particularly through the application of the CIPP Holistic Evaluation Model. This model, which was originally used in general education, has been adapted to analyze not only the final outcomes of education but also the moral and spiritual aspects of Islamic education. This study identifies the unique strengths and weaknesses in each dimension of CIPP at three Islamic universities: STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, STAI Al-

Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, and STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai.

In the Context dimension, all three institutions have a vision that prioritizes Islamic values and the strengthening of moral character, but the analysis of student and community needs is still not well structured. This shows the importance of a more in-depth context analysis for the relevance of educational policy. In the Input dimension, there are significant variations. STAI Al-Hikmah Medan has competent teaching staff but limited facilities. STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi faces digital infrastructure constraints and limited funds, while STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai has strong institutional support but has not yet developed a systematic character evaluation system. This reinforces the CIPP theory, which emphasizes that inadequate inputs hinder the achievement of educational outcomes. In the Process dimension, the cognitive approach is still dominant. Despite developments in adab interactions and spiritual activities, the character evaluation systems at the three universities are still not well integrated. In the Product dimension, although academic achievements are good, students' moral and spiritual achievements still vary. This reinforces that even with strong inputs and context, if the process is not optimal, the results can still be low.

Overall, the findings of this study indicate that the successful implementation of the CIPP model is highly dependent on the overall integration and synergy between

dimensions. A strong context, in the form of the vision, mission, and direction of institutional development, must be balanced with adequate inputs such as human resources, infrastructure, and relevant evaluation instruments. These inputs are then implemented through a systematic, innovative, and value-oriented learning process. Thus, the final product in the form of improvements in the academic, character, and spiritual quality of students can be achieved optimally and sustainably, reflecting the effectiveness of the holistic application of the CIPP model.

This research makes an important contribution to the development of educational evaluation theory by integrating moral and spiritual dimensions into a more holistic evaluation model, particularly in the context of Islamic education. These findings enrich educational evaluation theory by providing an understanding that Islamic education not only assesses cognitive aspects but also evaluates students' character and spirituality. This is in line with the principle of holistic evaluation, which emphasizes the importance of assessing affective and behavioral aspects, not just academic results.

In more detail, the contribution to theory can be explained as follows: (1) Expansion of Evaluation Dimensions: This study shows that Islamic education evaluation must include not only cognitive aspects, but also moral and spiritual aspects. This contributes to the CIPP theory, which was previously applied more in the context of general education, by

adding a distinctive religious perspective to evaluation; (2) Interrelationship between Dimensions: The findings of this study confirm that the success of an education curriculum is highly dependent on the interrelationship between the CIPP dimensions. Weaknesses in one dimension, such as inadequate context or unstructured processes, can reduce success in other dimensions, including the final product. This reinforces the theory that evaluation must look at the entire integrated system; (3) Improvement of Context Analysis: This study introduces the importance of analyzing student and community needs as an integral part of the context. This shows that a more in-depth context analysis is essential to match educational goals with the real needs of the community and students; (4) Holistic Implementation Strategy: This study offers a more holistic strategy for improving the quality of education with emphasizing the importance of synergy between the CIPP dimensions. Only by strengthening each dimension in an integrated manner can Islamic education in higher education produce graduates who excel not only academically, but also in character and spirituality; (5) Adaptive CIPP Evaluation Model in the Islamic Context: This study also shows that the CIPP Evaluation Model can be adapted to meet specific needs in Islamic education by adding character and spirituality assessment as an important part of curriculum evaluation.

Table 1. Contribution of Research Findings to Theory

Dimension	Research Findings	Contribution to Theory
Context	Strong Islamic vision, but analysis of student needs is not yet optimal.	Emphasizes the importance of a more in-depth context analysis so that educational objectives are relevant to real needs.
Input	Variations in human resources and facilities; competent teaching at STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, but limited facilities.	Emphasizing that adequate input, including instructor competence and facilities, is crucial for achieving optimal educational outcomes.
Process	Lecture-based approaches and written exams remain dominant, while spiritual activities are not yet integrated into formal evaluations.	Highlighting the importance of implementing systematic and structured character evaluation in learning.
Product	Academic achievements are good, but moral and spiritual achievements vary.	Contributions to theory indicate that educational evaluation should include moral and spiritual aspects, not just cognitive ones.

CONCLUSION

The conclusion of this study shows that the implementation of the CIPP Holistic Evaluation Model in the Islamic education curriculum at three Islamic universities—STAI Al-Hikmah Medan, STAI Al-Hikmah Tebing Tinggi, and STIT Al-Washliyah Binjai—reveals specific strengths and weaknesses in each CIPP dimension. In the Context dimension, although all three institutions have a clear vision regarding Islamic values, analysis of student and community needs still needs to be improved to increase the relevance of the curriculum. In the Input dimension, there are significant variations in resource support, with some colleges facing constraints in adequate facilities and institutions. In the Process dimension, learning approaches that rely heavily on lectures and written exams need to be improved by integrating spiritual activities and more systematic character evaluation. In the Product dimension, although student academic achievement is relatively good, student moral and spiritual achievement varies,

indicating the need for consistent emphasis on character and spiritual evaluation. Overall, this study concludes that the successful implementation of the CIPP model is highly dependent on strengthening the synergy between dimensions in a comprehensive manner. This study contributes to CIPP theory by integrating moral and spiritual dimensions into the evaluation of Islamic education. Strengthening each dimension in an integrated manner will produce graduates who excel not only in academic aspects but also in character and morality, which is very important in the context of Islamic education.

REFERENCES

- Abshor, M. U., Wafiati, I., Sorfina, N. S., & Ma'arif, S. (2024). Applying the CIPP Model to Assess the Impact of the Tahfidz Class Program on Quranic Retention. *Journal of Islamic Education Management Research*.
- Al-Ghazali, A. H. (2011). *Ihya' Ulum al-Din*. Dar al-Hadith.
- Al Attas, S. M. N. (1997). *Aims and objectives of*

Islamic education. King Abdulaziz University.

- Ali, S., & Rehman, A. (2018). Evaluating the Quality of Education in Welfare Schools Using the CIPP Model. *Education Research and Reviews*, 13(6), 177–186. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1180614.pdf>
- Aziz, S., Mahmood, M., & Rehman, Z. (2018). Implementation of CIPP Model for Quality Evaluation at School Level: a case study. *Journal of Education and Educational Development*, 5(1), 189–206. <http://journals.iobmresearch.com/index.php/JEED/index>
- Bogdan, Robert, C. (2011). *Qualitative Research for Education; An Introduction to Theories and Methods*. Prentice Hall.
- Creswell, J. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and Research design; Choosing Among Five Approaches*. Sage Publications.
- Finney, T. L. (2020). Confirmative Evaluation: New CIPP Evaluation Model. *Journal of Modern Applied Statistical Methods*, 18(2). <https://doi.org/10.22237/jmasm/1598889893%0A%0A>
- Frye, A. W., & Hemmer, P. A. (2012). Program Evaluation Models and Related Theories *Medical Teacher*, 34(5), e288–e299. <https://doi.org/10.3109/0142159X.2012.668637>
- Hasiara, L. O. (2018). *Penelitian Multi Kasus dan Multi Situs*. CV.IRDH.
- Ilyasa, M. D. J., & Madjid, A. (2021). Evaluasi Program Terapi Al-Qur'an Melalui Model Context, Input, Process, Product (CIPP). *Intiqad: Jurnal Agama dan Pendidikan Islam*, 13(1), 135–154. <https://doi.org/10.30596/-intiqad.v13i1.6634>
- Ionescu, R. V., Zlati, M. L., Antohi, V. M., Cristache, N., & Raducan, M. (2022). Educational Performance between the Human Resource's Theoretical Paradigm and the Practical Mentality. Analysis at the European level. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.10388>
- Irsad, M. (2016). Pengembangan Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam di Madrasah (Studi Atas Pemikiran Muhaimin. *Jurnal Iqra': Kajian Ilmu Pendidikan*, 1(2), 230–245. <https://journal.iaimnumetrolampung.ac.id/index.php/ji/article/view/75>
- Jannah, M. (2022). The Effectiveness of Integrated Microteaching Lesson Study Lectures Using the Evaluation of CIPP Models. *Journal of Quality Assurance in Islamic Education*, 2(2), 99–108.
- Kamara, S. A., M'Briwa, F. F., & Sesay, A. (2024). Government Intervention, Curriculum Relevance And Financial Resource Allocation: Impacts on Student Learning Outcomes IN Human Capital Development in Sierra Leone. *European Journal of Political Science Studies*, 7(2). <https://doi.org/10.46827/ejps.v7i2.1752>
- Karaca, F., & Ozdemir, M. (2020). Evaluating Preschool Education Programs According to the CIPP Model: A Mixed-Method Study. *Pedagogical Research*, 9(1), 45–58. <https://www.pedagogicalresearch.com/article/evaluation-of-preschool-education-program-according-to-cipp-model-9701>
- Karakuş, G. (2021). Solutions for Barriers in Curriculum Implementation. *African Educational Research Journal*, 9(2), 591–599. <https://doi.org/10.30918/aerj.92.21.084>
- Lippe, M., & Carter, P. (2018). Using the CIPP Model to Assess Nursing Education Program Quality and Merit. *Teaching and Learning in Nursing*, 13(1), 9–13. <https://frontiersin.org/journals/education/articles/10.3389/feduc.2022.924374/>
- Lubis, R. R., Hanafiah, M. A., Dalimunthe, R. A., & Rashed, Z. N. (2024). Modernization of Islamic Education Lecture AT Islamic Higher Education Institutions in Contemporary Indonesia. *Miqot: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman*, 48(2), 146–168. <http://dx.doi.org/10.30821/miqot.v48i2.1189>

- Mirzazadeh, A., & al., et. (2016). Undergraduate Medical Education Programme Renewal: a Longitudinal Context, Input, Process and Product Evaluation Study. *Perspectives on Medical Education*, 5(1), 15–23. <https://frontiersin.org/journals/education/articles/10.3389/feduc.2022.924374/>
- Oktapiani, A., Ma'shum, S., & BK, M. T. (2021). Peran Kepala Sekolah Dalam Pengembangan Kurikulum Pendidikan Islam di Madrasah Tsanawiyah Swasta At-Taubah Karawang. *Edumaspul: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 5(2), 1056–1061. <https://doi.org/10.33487/edumaspul.v5i2.4670>
- Poblete, M. L. O. (2014). Using the CIPP Model to Assess the University's Health Programs. *Journal of Higher Education Outreach and Engagement*, 8(1), 16–30. <https://frontiersin.org/journals/education/articles/10.3389/feduc.2022.924374>
- Rohmani, A. H. (2020). Peran Kepala Sekolah dalam Pengembangan Kurikulum PAI. *Tafhim Al-Ilmi*, 11(2), 277–291. <https://doi.org/10.37459/tafhim.v11i2.3756>
- Rooholamini, A., & al., et. (2017). Program evaluation of an Integrated Basic Science Medical Curriculum using the CIPP model. *Journal of Medical Education*, 21(3), 123–134. <https://frontiersin.org/journals/education/articles/10.3389/feduc.2022.924374/>
- Shimaneni, F., & Kiley, J. (2025). Challenges of Managing Academic Staff Performance in a Namibian Private Higher Education. *Transformation in Higher Education*, 10. <https://doi.org/10.4102/the.v10i0.442>
- Solehah, D. U. (2022). Analisis Evaluasi Kurikulum Pendidikan Agama Islam Model CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) di SMP Muhammadiyah 60 Medan. *Jurnal Mudarrisuna: Media Kajian Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 12(4), 70–86. <https://doi.org/10.22373/jm.v12i4.11967>
- Stufflebeam, D L, & Shinkfield, A. J. (2007). *Evaluation Theory, Models, and Applications*. Jossey-Bass.
- Stufflebeam, Daniel L. (2003). *The CIPP Model for Evaluation: An Update, a Review of the Model's Development, and a Checklist to Guide Implementation* BT - *International Handbook of Educational Evaluation* (T. Kellaghan & D. L. Stufflebeam (eds.); pp. 31–62). Kluwer Academic Publishers. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-010-0309-4_3
- Susilowati, E., Chotimah, C., & Junaris, I. (2025). Efektivitas Evaluasi Kurikulum Berbasis Model CIPP Terhadap Peningkatan Kualitas Pembelajaran. *JIRER Journal Islamic Religious Education Research*, 1(1), 84–90. <https://albaayaninstitute.org/index.php/jirer/article/view/53>
- Vishnupriyan, M. (2017). Curriculum evaluation: Using the Context, Input, Process and Product (CIPP) Model for Decision Making. *Indian Journal of Continuing Nursing Education*, 18(2), 12–18. https://journals.lww.com/ijcn/fulltext/2017/18020/curriculum_evaluation__using_the_context,_input,.1.aspx
- Yoshany, N., & Al., E. (2025). Beyond Traditional Training: a Comprehensive CIPP Evaluation of medical internships: assessing Program Design, Implementation, and Clinical Competency Outcomes. *BMC Medical Education*, 25(3), 827. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-025-07404-3>
- Zhang, G., & al., et. (2011). Using the Context, Input, Process, and Product Evaluation Model (CIPP) as a Comprehensive Framework to Guide the Planning, Implementation, and Assessment of Service-Learning Programs. *Journal of Higher Education Outreach and Engagement*, 15(4), 57–84. <https://frontiersin.org/journals/education/articles/10.3389/feduc.2022.924374/>